Discussion of Patrick Bolton and Martin Oehmke

'Bank Resolution and the Structure of Global Banks'

Arnoud W. A. Boot University of Amsterdam July 7, 2017

Key question and approach

 How to deal with resolution of global systemic financial institutions?

Objectives:

- Orderly and timely resolution
- Preserve critical functions
- Keep tax payer out of the picture

How?

- FDIC type P&A does not work (complexity)
- Liability focus: recapitalization via SPOE or MPOE?

Highly valuable type of research

- Guide policymakers in understanding key trade-offs with respects to choice between cross border bank resolution regimes
 - How (national) regulators' incentives interact with those of the banks involved
- Build bridge between academic research and practice
 - Stylized model to bring in richness...

Results/insights

- Minimum TLAC regulation might be needed
- Absence of supra-national powers imposes severe constraints on feasibility coordinated (SPOE) resolution
 - Ex ante and particularly ex post
- More asymmetry between countries, pushes toward MPOE
- Potential impact on banking structure and incentives

Relevance beyond question...

- War stories from The Netherlands/Belgium Fortis...
 - Likeminded countries, MoU's would suffice...

Key modelling features

- Bank resolution possible
- Diversification benefit in global banking
- Complementarities in banking operations across borders → gives benefit to SPOE (on top of diversification)
- No runs, short term financing (unless not fully riskless) source of profits
- Long term financing is costly, may lead to underfunding
- Ex ante investment in own (stand-alone) structure could insure against loss of complementarities later

Benefits of coordination (SPOE)

- Better allocation of risk bearing capacity TLAC
- and preserving complementarities in the business

Comments

Obviously, scope had to be limited...

- No timely intervention beyond scope
- TLAC is available, no shortage
- No runs, externalities limited

Comments cont'd

Are we ignoring assets/legal structure complexities?

[Except...] Ex ante investment in own (stand-alone) structure could insure against loss of complementarities later (upon failure of SPOE)]

Liability focus has some logic (see FDIC/BoE, 2012; FSB, 2014; Dodd-Frank/BRRD)

- Timely resolution more or less needed for this
- Clarity on assets and where they are is needed
 - But where assets are not always clear; asset grabbing not unusual, etc. Strategic behavior...

Comments cont'd – Interaction bank incentives, regulatory behavior

- Extension: SPOE transfers could affect incentives in each local operation
 - Incentives involve effort to improve returns (not risk taking)
 - Interesting result: sharing mutes those incentives, yet countervailing effect: lower TLAC reduces dilution of returns to effort!

But is bank run locally? Approach/results assume this... Seems at odds with SPOE...

Comments cont'd – Adding pre resolution phase: forbearance

- Elephant in the room.... Forbearance... (e.g. Italy and bad loans..)
 - Compare SSM to SRM in EU → interesting observation: "Of course, whether the creation of such a supra-national resolution authority is politically feasible is a separate question".
 - Impact SPOE versus MPOE on forbearance incentives

Banking structure

Interaction regulation/bank behavior

- Bank may adjust its own structure to deal with lack of coordination ex post
 - Anticipating chaos of SPOE, they may go for standalone structures with country specific back offices and systems to perfectly match MPOE
 - Note: some countries have put this in as requirement (e.g. New Zealand)

Branches versus subsidiaries

- What does analysis imply for branch/Subsidiary choice? E.g. Nordea went to branch structure
 - Is branch structure natural analogy for SPOE? Or is there more to it?

Hybrid models

- I like the notion of a hybrid model... in paper, very limited – some locally dedicated risk bearing capacity to limit ex post transfers (and time consistency issues) – helps preserve SPOE
- More general notion of hybrid: is SPOE versus MPOE a discrete choice?
 - Regionally you can have SPOE, yet overall MPOE over the regions...
 - More??